

Message

From: Daly, Carl [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=AD9EB9A4AE3A427BA3A1907142AD3E0C-DALY, CARL]
Sent: 6/21/2021 10:46:12 PM
To: Raines, Brenda [Raines.Brenda@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: Utah's 179B(b) Demonstration

Yes, I don't think Monica can make it but we need one of the attorneys to show up.

Carl Daly
303-312-6416

From: Raines, Brenda <Raines.Brenda@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 21, 2021 4:44 PM
To: Daly, Carl <Daly.Carl@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Utah's 179B(b) Demonstration

Hey Carl -- Should Monica/Randall/Everett & Brian be listed as optionas?

From: Daly, Carl <Daly.Carl@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 21, 2021 4:08 PM
To: Jackson, Scott <Jackson.Scott@epa.gov>; Brimmer, Amanda <Brimmer.Amanda@epa.gov>; Bean, Clayton <bean.clayton@epa.gov>; Fulton, Abby <Fulton.Abbey@epa.gov>; Boydston, Michael <Boydston.Michael@epa.gov>
Cc: Morales, Monica <Morales.Monica@epa.gov>; Raines, Brenda <Raines.Brenda@epa.gov>; Cherry, Randall <Cherry.Randall@epa.gov>; Volk, Everett <volk.everett@epa.gov>; Joffe, Brian <Joffe.Brian@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Utah's 179B(b) Demonstration

Looks like 12 to 1 works best for those that responded. We will need someone from ORC so hopefully Randall or Everett/Brian can join then too.

Brenda can you send out a hold for all of us for Thursday 6/24 at noon for 1 hr?

Thanks

Carl Daly
303-312-6416

From: Jackson, Scott <Jackson.Scott@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 21, 2021 3:16 PM
To: Daly, Carl <Daly.Carl@epa.gov>; Brimmer, Amanda <Brimmer.Amanda@epa.gov>; Bean, Clayton <bean.clayton@epa.gov>; Fulton, Abby <Fulton.Abbey@epa.gov>; Boydston, Michael <Boydston.Michael@epa.gov>
Cc: Morales, Monica <Morales.Monica@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Utah's 179B(b) Demonstration

Thursday, 12-1 works best for me.

Scott Jackson
Air Quality Planning Branch Chief
U.S. EPA Region 8
(303) 312-6107

From: Daly, Carl <Daly.Carl@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 21, 2021 2:16 PM
To: Brimmer, Amanda <Brimmer.Amanda@epa.gov>; Bean, Clayton <bean.clayton@epa.gov>; Fulton, Abby <Fulton.Abbey@epa.gov>; Boydston, Michael <Boydston.Michael@epa.gov>; Jackson, Scott <Jackson.Scott@epa.gov>
Cc: Morales, Monica <Morales.Monica@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: Utah's 179B(b) Demonstration

Does Thursday work for you all?

Carl Daly
303-312-6416

On Jun 21, 2021, at 2:02 PM, Joro Walker <joro.walker@westernresources.org> wrote:

Thank you again for agreeing to meet with us.

After getting feedback from our groups, it turns out that June 24 -- 12 to 1 pm and 4 to 5 work best for us. If one of these times do not work for EPA, we of course can come up with more options.

We look forward to talking to you.

**** this communication is privileged, confidential and exempt from disclosure ****

JORO WALKER, ESQ. | General Counsel
Western Resource Advocates
307 West 200 South Street, Ste 2000
Salt Lake City, UT 84101
801-413-7353 (d) | 801-487-9911 (o)
[facebook](#) | [twitter](#) | [linkedin](#) | [donate](#)
www.WesternResourceAdvocates.org



From: Daly, Carl [<mailto:Daly.Carl@epa.gov>]
Sent: Thursday, June 17, 2021 8:24 AM
To: Joro Walker <joro.walker@westernresources.org>
Cc: Morales, Monica <Morales.Monica@epa.gov>; Jackson, Scott <Jackson.Scott@epa.gov>; Boydston,

Michael <Boydston.Michael@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: Utah's 179B(b) Demonstration

Ms Walker

We have reviewed your emails regarding Utah's 179B demonstration and we are preparing a response. As you probably know, EPA will be making final decisions on the attainment status of ozone nonattainment areas by early next year.

We would be happy to schedule a call with you to discuss EPA's ozone attainment determination process. Please provide some dates/times that work for you.

Regards

Carl Daly
303-312-6416

On Jun 16, 2021, at 7:32 PM, Joro Walker <joro.walker@westernresources.org> wrote:

Dear Carl Daly,

I have sent two emails to Acting Regional Administrator Thomas (on behalf of four Utah eNGOs) seeking information on Utah's 179B(b) Demonstration, submitted to EPA on May 28, 2021 and have not received a reply. I was hoping that you might respond to my emails. I am quite puzzled by EPA's silence on what I thought would be a very reasonable request in keeping with EPA's mission and concern for the citizens of Utah. Here are the texts of the emails I sent to EPA on June 12 and June 3 respectively. Thank you for considering our requests:

Dear Acting Regional Administrator Thomas,

We have not heard back from you on our request (see below) relating to Utah's 179B(b) Demonstration, recently submitted to you. We cannot overly stress the public's profound interest in the outcome of EPA's review of the Demonstration. Our health and the health of our families, communities and environment is on the line.

Would you be so kind as to respond with an explanation of the EPA review process triggered by the Demonstration and the public involvement in that process.

We also ask that we be given the chance to meet with members of your staff who will be reviewing the Demonstration.

As we explained, the public was excluded from participating in the decisionmaking and technical analysis that led to the Demonstration and was not allowed to comment on the proposal in a way that could influence

our state government in any way. Particularly because our voices have not been heard, we are hoping that EPA will provide us with a meaningful opportunity to discuss and comment on the proposal.

Thank you again for all you do to protect public health and the environment.

Dear Acting Regional Administrator Thomas,

We understand that on May 28, 2021, Utah submitted to you a 179B(b) Demonstration that purports to show “but for” anthropogenic international emissions, the Northern Wasatch Front Nonattainment Area would have attained the 2015 ozone standard as of August 2021. Should the 179B(b) Demonstration be successful, the consequences to the people living and working along the NWF, including those from disproportionately impacted communities, would be severe. Essentially, Utahns would be denied the protections afforded them by the Clean Air Act and the State of Utah would be excused from taking the steps to reduce emissions of ozone precursors that would otherwise apply to a moderate ozone nonattainment area.

Despite EPA Guidance encouraging significant public involvement in any 179B(b) Demonstration and despite requests for more time, Utah’s Division of Air Quality gave the public 20 days to comment on its submission. More surprisingly, DAQ did not address our comments or those filed by others, but merely attached them to the May 28 submission two days after the public comment period expired.

We are extremely concerned that our evaluation and critique of the 179B(b) Demonstration were not addressed and that Utah has not taken seriously its obligation to involve the public in a decision that has the potential to damage the health and adversely impact the welfare of millions of Utahns. In this context we ask EPA to: 1) let us know in detail of the process – including any opportunities for public comment – that will result from or be triggered by the submission of the 179B(b) Demonstration; and, 2) give us the opportunity to meet with EPA staff who will be reviewing the Demonstration.

We have attached our comments on the 179B(b) Demonstration for ease of access.

Thank you very much for all you do to protect the public health and welfare and the environment. We look forward to hearing from you.

**** this communication is privileged, confidential and exempt from disclosure ****

JORO WALKER, ESQ. | General Counsel
Western Resource Advocates
307 West 200 South Street, Ste 2000

Salt Lake City, UT 84101
801-413-7353 (d) | 801-487-9911 (o)
[facebook](#) | [twitter](#) | [linkedin](#) | [donate](#)
www.WesternResourceAdvocates.org

<image003.png>